

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

VOLUME 2

September 1983

37
11
933
1.2

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 14 1983

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

EMPLOYMENT LAW

by

PROFESSOR BRIAN LANGILLE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

VOLUME 2

September 1983



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/employmentlaw02lang>

Table of Contents

PAGE

I.	<u>INTRODUCTION</u>	1
A.	Fuller & Perdue, "The Reliance Interest in Contract Damages."	1
B.	A.A. Leff, "Economic Analysis of Law: Some Realism About Nominalism."	1
C.	Thomas Nagel, Review of R. Nozick, <u>Anarchy, State, and Utopia</u> .	3
D.	Duncan Kennedy, "The Structure of Blackstone's Commentaries."	4
E.	Robert W. Gordon, "New Developments in Legal Theory."	6
II.	<u>WORK, EMPLOYMENT, AND THE "PROPER" LEGAL ANALYSIS</u>	11
A.	<u>Introduction</u>	11
1.	Studs Terkel, <u>Working</u> .	11
2.	Seabrook, <u>Unemployment</u> .	22
3.	Harry Braverman, <u>Labour and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century</u> .	23
4.	David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity."	32
5.	Adina Schwartz, "Meaningful Work."	39
6.	Wood and Kumar, <u>The Current Industrial Relations Scene in Canada</u>	46
B.	<u>The Contract/Status Debate</u>	58
1.	Sir Henry Maine, <u>Ancient Law</u> .	58
2.	Karl Polanyi, <u>The Great Transformation</u> .	60
3.	Milton Friedman, <u>Capitalism & Freedom</u> .	61
4.	Richard Posner, <u>The Economics of Justice</u> .	67
5.	Elizabeth Mensch, "The History of Mainstream Legal Thought."	69
6.	John Rawls, <u>A Theory of Justice</u> .	71
7.	Scanlon, "Liberty, Contract and Contribution."	72
8.	David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity."	73

9.	Tuohy and Trebilcock, <u>Policy Options in the Regulation of Asbestos-Related Health Hazards.</u>	82
10.	Barry J. Reiter, "The Control of Contract Power."	87
C.	<u>Questions</u>	91
D.	<u>Contractual Analysis</u>	92
1.	Innis Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada.</u>	92
2.	Arthurs, Carter and Glasbeek, <u>Labour Law and Industrial Relations in Canada.</u>	92
3.	Freedland, <u>The Contract of Employment.</u>	92
4.	Ian McNeil, "The Many Futures of Contract."	96
5.	Fox, <u>Beyond Contract: Work, Power and Trust Relations.</u>	104
III.	<u>THE SEARCH FOR THE "ESSENCE" OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP AND THE ANSWER TO THE QUESTION "IS THIS PERSON AN EMPLOYEE?"</u>	107
A.	<u>General</u>	107
1.	Introduction.	107
2.	Questions.	107
3.	<u>Short v. Henderson.</u>	107
a)	Kahn-Freund, <u>Note.</u>	108
b)	Davis and Freedland, <u>Labour Law: Text and Materials.</u>	108
4.	<u>Ready Mixed Concrete v. Min. of Pensions and National Insurance.</u>	109
5.	<u>Re Becker Milk Co.</u>	112
6.	<u>Re Becker Milk Co. (Div. Ct.).</u>	121
7.	<u>Onyshuk v. Duncan Bros. Ltd.</u>	126
8.	<u>Salvation Army Sheltered Workshop and Kaszuba</u>	128
B.	<u>The Importance of Avoiding Formalism</u>	172
1.	<u>NLRB v. Hearst Publications.</u>	172
2.	Ontario <u>Labour Relations Act.</u>	179
3.	<u>Denham v. Midland Employers' Mutual Assurance Ltd.</u>	179
4.	<u>I.L.A. v. M.E.A.</u>	183
5.	Ludwig Wittgenstein, <u>Philosophical Investigations.</u>	185
C.	<u>Notes and Questions</u>	188
1.	<u>Re D.J.'s Family Centre Ltd.</u>	188
2.	Problem.	188

IV.	<u>HIRING</u>	190
A.	<u>Introduction</u>	190
	Freedland, <u>The Contract of Employment.</u>	190
B.	<u>Discrimination in Hiring</u>	195
1.	Richard Posner, <u>The Economics of Justice.</u>	195
2.	Ronald Dworkin, <u>Taking Rights Seriously.</u>	199
3.	Fallon, "To Each According to His Ability, From None According to His Race: The Concept of Merit in Anti-Discrimination Law."	204
4.	<u>The Common Law.</u>	209
	Bd. of Governors of Seneca College v. Bhadauria.	209
5.	<u>Statutes.</u>	218
a)	<u>Griggs v. Duke Power Co.</u>	219
b)	<u>Note.</u>	223
c)	<u>OHRC v. Simpson-Sears Ltd. (Div. Ct.).</u>	227
d)	<u>OHRC v. Simpson-Sears Ltd. (C.A.).</u>	241
e)	<u>Morley Rand v. Sealy Eastern Limited.</u>	243
f)	<u>Statistical Evidence.</u>	262
i)	Sullivan, Zimmer and Richard, <u>Federal Statutory Law of Employment Discrimination.</u>	262
ii)	<u>Re Windsor Bd. of Education.</u>	265
iii)	<u>Dothard v. Rawlinson.</u>	279
6.	<u>The Constitution</u>	290
	Corwin, <u>The Constitution and What it Means Today.</u>	290
7.	<u>Affirmative Action</u>	292
a)	<u>Some Theoretical Considerations</u>	292
i)	George Sher, "Justifying Reverse Discrimination in Employment."	292
ii)	Richard Wasserstrom, "Preferential Treatment."	303
b)	<u>Affirmative Action in the Courts</u>	334
i)	<u>Athabasca Tribal Council v. Amoco (Alta. C.A.).</u>	334
ii)	<u>Re Athabasca Tribal Council and Amoco (S.C.C.).</u>	353

V. <u>THE CONTENT OF THE EMPLOYMENT RELATIONSHIP (EMPLOYER AND EMPLOYEE RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS)</u>	358
<u>Introduction</u>	359
Fox, <u>Beyond Contract: Work, Power, and Trust Relationships.</u>	359
A. <u>Express Obligations and Their Variation</u>	360
1. <u>Peerless Laundry v. Neal.</u>	360
2. <u>Hill v. Peter Gorman.</u>	363
3. <u>K.M.A. Catering v. Howie.</u>	375
4. <u>Campbell v. MacMillan Bloedel.</u>	378
B. <u>Restrictive Covenants</u>	379
1. <u>Nordenfelt v. Maxim Nordenfelt.</u>	379
2. <u>M.S. Drapers v. Reynolds.</u>	379
3. <u>Innis Christie, Employment Law in Canada.</u>	381
4. <u>Kores Manufacturing v. Kolok Manufacturing.</u>	384
C. <u>An Aside About Pensions and Their Regulation</u>	390
1. <u>Types of Pensions</u>	390
Joel Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer for Lawyers."	390
2. <u>Legislative Initiatives</u>	393
a) Regulation of Private Plans	393
i) Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada.</u>	393
ii) Ontario <u>Pensions Benefits Act.</u>	395
iii) Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer for Lawyers."	396
b) The Canada Pension Plan and Old Age Security Pension	397
i) Arthur, Carter and Glasbeek, <u>Labour Law</u>	397
ii) Fichaud, "Pensions: A Primer For Lawyers."	399
3. <u>Pensions and Discrimination</u>	400
a) <u>City of Los Angeles v. Manhart.</u>	400
b) Richard Schweiker, "Insurance by Gender."	407
c) <u>Arizona Governing Committee v. Norris.</u>	408
D. <u>A Note About Implied Obligations in General</u>	418
1. <u>Christie, Employment Law in Canada.</u>	418
E. <u>Competence</u>	425
1. <u>Cassidy v. Ministry of Health.</u>	425

2.	<u>Lister v. Romford Ice & Cold Storage</u>	434
3.	<u>Sealand of the Pacific.</u>	436
4.	<u>D.H. Overmyer v. Wallace Transfer.</u>	437
5.	<u>Janata Bank v. Ahmed.</u>	440
6.	Barry J. Reiter, "Contracts, Torts, Relations and Reliance."	445
F.	<u>Fidelity, Inventions, Competition, Trade Secrets, Confidential Information, Fiduciary Obligations and Bribes.</u>	453
1.	<u>Robb v. Green.</u>	453
2.	<u>State Vacuum Stores v. Phillips.</u>	454
3.	<u>Triplex Safety Glass v. Scoriah.</u>	460
4.	<u>W.J. Gage v. Sugden.</u>	461
5.	<u>Spiroll Corp. v. Putti.</u>	466
6.	Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada.</u>	467
7.	James O'Connor, <u>The Fiscal Crisis of the State.</u>	471
8.	<u>Reading v. Attorney-General.</u>	473
9.	<u>Canadian Aero Service v. O'Malley.</u>	474
VI	<u>TERMINATION</u>	491
A.	<u>Introduction</u>	492
1.	David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity."	492
2.	Katherine Swinton, "Contract Law and the Employment Relationship: The Proper Forum for Reform."	495
B.	<u>Expiration of a Fixed Term and Agreed Periods of Notice</u>	499
1.	The <u>Employment Standards Act.</u>	499
2.	Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada.</u>	499
3.	<u>Re Christopher and CKXM-FM.</u>	505
4.	<u>Nardocchio v. CIBC.</u>	511
C.	<u>Retirement</u>	527
1.	<u>Employment Standards Act Regulations.</u>	527
2.	<u>Bell Canada v. OPEIU.</u>	527

D. <u>Firing.</u>	537
1. <u>Termination With Due Notice or Pay in Lieu</u>	537
a) The Common Law	537
i) <u>Carter v. Bell & Sons.</u>	537
ii) <u>Bardal v. The Globe & Mail.</u>	539
iii) <u>Bohemier v. Storwal International.</u>	545
iv) <u>Suttie v. Metro Transit.</u>	550
v) Harris, <u>Wrongful Dismissal.</u>	554
vi) McDonald v. Swift Canadian Co. Ltd	557

VOLUME 2

b) Remedies for Wrongful Dismissal	558
i) Quantum and Heads of Damage	558
(a) <u>Addis v. Gramophone Ltd.</u>	558
(b) <u>McMinn v. Town of Oakville.</u>	570
(c) <u>Pilon v. Peugeot.</u>	577
(d) <u>Bohemier v. Storwal International.</u>	581
(e) <u>Dobson v. T. Eaton Co.</u>	586
(f) <u>Centennial Centre v. VS Services.</u>	590
ii) The Duty to Mitigate.	592
<u>Red Deer College v. Michaels.</u>	592
iii) <u>Specific Performance</u>	596
(a) <u>De Francesco v. Barnum.</u>	596
(b) <u>Hill v. C.A. Parsons.</u>	601
(c) <u>Warner Bros. v. Nelson.</u>	613
c) Statutory Regulation	621
i) The <u>Employment Standards Act.</u>	621
ii) Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada.</u>	624
iii) <u>Freightliner of Canada Ltd. v. Canadian Association of Industrial, Mechanical and Allied Workers, Local 14 and Employment Standards Board.</u>	628
2. <u>Summary Dismissal: Dismissal With Cause</u>	632
a) Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada.</u>	632
b) <u>Laws v. London Chronicle.</u>	642
c) <u>Markey v. Port Weller Dry Docks.</u>	645

3. <u>Quitting, Constructive Dismissal, and Variation</u>	657
a) <u>Christie, Employment Law in Canada.</u>	657
b) <u>Thomas Marshall Exports v. Guinle.</u>	660
c) <u>Note: Gunton v. Richmond-on-Thames.</u>	668
d) <u>Could v. Hermes Electronics.</u>	672
e) <u>Baker v. Burns Foods.</u>	684
f) <u>Wallace v. Toronto-Dominion Bank.</u>	686
g) <u>Longman v. FBDB.</u>	702
h) <u>Peerless Laundry v. Neal</u>	715
i) <u>Hill v. Peter Gorman</u>	715
4. <u>A Pause for Reflection</u>	716
a) David Beatty, "Labour is not a Commodity."	717
b) David Cohen, "The Relationship of Contractual Remedies to Political and Social Status."	733
5. <u>Natural Justice and the Duty of Fairness</u>	742
a) <u>Ridge v. Baldwin.</u>	742
b) <u>Re Nicholson and Haldimand-Norfolk Reg. Bd.</u>	747
c) <u>Robson v. General Motors.</u>	757
d) <u>Pulsifer v. GTE Sylvania Canada Ltd.</u>	762
6. <u>Discipline</u>	767
a) <u>Hanley v. Pease & Partners.</u>	767
b) <u>McGavin Toastmaster v. Ainscough</u>	768
c) <u>Adams, Grievance Arbitration of Discharge Cases.</u>	774
7. <u>Section 61.5 of the Canada Labour Code.</u>	783
a) <u>Robert v. Bank of Nova Scotia.</u>	783
b) <u>Re Bank of Montreal and Wheeler.</u>	792
c) <u>Fleury v. Speedy.</u>	801
d) <u>W. Ilberg v. Jo-Ann Trucking.</u>	801
e) <u>Some Statistics.</u>	807
8. <u>Frustration</u>	805
a) <u>Employment Standards Act.</u>	805
b) <u>Christie, Employment Law in Canada.</u>	805
c) <u>Ottoman Bank v. Chakarian.</u>	811
d) <u>O'Connell v. Harkema Express.</u>	817
e) <u>Question.</u>	828

9. <u>Employer Going Out of Business</u>	829
a) <u>Nokes v. Doncaster Amalgamated.</u>	829
b) <u>Christie, Employment Law in Canada.</u>	829
c) <u>Town of Yarmouth v. Manser.</u>	838
d) <u>The Employment Standards Act.</u>	841
e) "Preferential Hiring Rights in Business Relocations."	843
10. <u>Layoffs, Suspensions and Lockouts.</u>	856
a) <u>Christie, Employment Law.</u>	856
b) <u>TWU v. B.C. Tel.</u>	864
11. <u>Redundancy</u>	870
a) <u>Baker v. Burns Foods</u>	870
b) <u>The Labour Adjustments Benefits Act.</u>	871
c) <u>James O'Connor, The Fiscal Crisis of the State.</u>	873
d) <u>R.J. Adams, "The Unorganized: The Rising Force?"</u>	877
12. <u>Prohibited Dismissals.</u>	879
a) Age Discrimination	879
i) <u>OHRC v. Borough of Etobicoke.</u>	879
ii) <u>Tuohy v. Ford Motor.</u>	889
b) Sexual Harassment	890
i) <u>Cox v. Super Great Submarine.</u>	890
ii) <u>Catherine MacKinnon, Sexual Harassment: A Case of Sex Discrimination.</u>	899
13. <u>Third Party Liability for Dismissals</u>	915
a) <u>Nicholls v. Corporation of Township of Richmond et al.</u>	915
<u>VII. HEALTH AND SAFETY: SELECTED PROBLEMS</u>	918
1. <u>Self-Help</u>	918
a) The Right to Know	918
i) <u>Note, "Occupational Health Risks and the Worker's Right to Know."</u>	919
ii) <u>Katherine Swinton, "Enforcement of Occupational Health and Safety Legislation."</u>	926
b) The Right to Refuse Unsafe Work	929
i) <u>Re Steel and United Steelworkers.</u>	929
ii) <u>Katherine Swinton, "Enforcement of Occupational Health and Safety Legislation."</u>	935
iii) Problem.	943

2. <u>Health and Safety and Sex Discrimination</u>	944
a) Linda Howard, "Hazardous Substances in the Workplace."	944
b) Advisory Memorandum 81-1 to the Minister of Labour.	949
c) "Exploring the Biomedical Interface Between OSHA and Title VII."	960
VIII. <u>THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT AND COLLECTIVE BARGAINING</u>	961
A. <u>Introduction</u>	961
B. <u>J.I. Case v. NLRB.</u>	961
C. <u>Re Telegram Publishing v. Zwelling.</u>	966
D. <u>Downey v. Scotia Square Hotel.</u>	975
E. <u>Brunet v. General Motors.</u>	979
F. <u>Problem.</u>	980
IX. <u>THE CONSTITUTIONAL DIVISION OF POWERS</u>	981
A. <u>A.B.C. Trilogy</u>	981
1. <u>Arrow Transfer.</u>	981
2. <u>Westcoast Transmission.</u>	986
3. <u>Canadian Telephone and Supplies.</u>	990
B. <u>A Further Problem</u>	994
1. <u>Railway Clerks and Marathon Realty.</u>	994
2. <u>Problem.</u>	998
C. <u>And Yet Another Problem</u>	990
<u>Evans v. Employment Standards Board.</u>	990
X. <u>PAY</u>	1010
A. <u>The Common Law Obligation to Pay</u>	1010
1. The "Entire Contract" Doctrine.	1010
<u>La Plante v. Kinnon.</u>	1010
2. <u>Sick Employees</u>	1011
a) <u>Dartmouth Ferry v. Marks.</u>	1011
b) <u>Note.</u>	1016
c) Karl Marx, <u>Das Kapital.</u>	1017
d) Della Risley, "An Introduction to the Position of the Sick Employee."	1023

B. <u>Statutory Control</u>	1036
1. <u>Payment in Kind and Truck Legislation</u>	1036
a) Hepple & O'Higgins, <u>Employment Law</u> .	1036
b) Edmund Bradwin, <u>The Bunkhouse Man</u> .	1036
c) Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada</u> .	1041
2. <u>Minimum Wage Legislation</u>	1052
a) Introduction	1052
i) M. Zaidi, "Study of the Effects of the \$1.25 Minimum Wage."	1052
ii) B.C. Dept. of Labour, "Study of Minimum Wage Legislation."	1053
b) Statistics and Exceptions	1053
i) Minimum Wages Across Canada.	1054
ii) Difference Between Minimum Wage Income and the Poverty Line.	1055
iii) Note.	1056
iv) <u>Domestics and Nannies Regulation</u>	1058
v) <u>Barnes v. Krisbair Tavern</u> .	1059
c) The Economics of a Minimum Wage	1066
i) Ostry and Zaidi, <u>Labour Economics in Canada</u> .	1067
ii) "Minimum Wages: A Survey of the Issues."	1068
iii) John Kenneth Galbraith, <u>Economics and the Public Purpose</u> .	1070
3. <u>Hours of Work, Overtime and Vacation Pay</u>	1072
a) Introduction	1072
b) Hours of Work and Overtime	1073
i) <u>McLeod v. Egan</u> .	1073
ii) <u>Westeel Roscoe v. United Steelworkers</u> .	1077
iii) Notes	1081
c) Vacations	1082
<u>Re St. Peter's Hospital</u> .	1082
4. <u>Recovery of Unpaid Pay</u>	1086
a) Procedures Under the <u>Employment Standards Act</u> .	1086
i) Annual Report: 1981-82.	1086
ii) <u>Re Downing and Graydon</u> .	1087

5. <u>Actual Recovery--Insolvency and Priorities</u>	1097
a) Christie, <u>Employment Law in Canada</u> .	1097
b) In Ontario	1099
i) <u>The Employment Standards Act</u>	1099
ii) <u>Campeau v. Provincial Bank</u> .	1099
iii) Trebilcock, Laskin, Reiter, <u>Debtor and Creditor</u> .	1105
iv) <u>Toronto Star</u> .	1107
v) <u>Toronto Globe and Mail</u> .	1108
vi) Statement to the Legislature.	1109
c) Statutory Trusts	1110
i) The <u>Employment Standards Act</u> .	1110
ii) <u>Re Dairy Maid Chocolates</u> .	1110
iii) <u>MacMillan v. Frizzel Plumbing</u> .	1113
iv) <u>Re Black Forest Restaurant</u> .	1117
v) <u>Re Alduco Mechanical Contractors</u> .	1129
d) Statutory Lien or Charge	1133
<u>Homeplan Realty v. Avco</u> .	1133
C. <u>Equal Pay</u>	1135
1. <u>The Problem</u>	1135
Armstrong & Armstrong, <u>The Double Ghetto: Canadian Women and Their Segregated Work</u> .	1135
2. <u>Legislative Initiatives</u>	1151
a) In Ontario	1151
i) <u>The Employment Standards Act</u>	1151
ii) Harry Glasbeek, <u>Labour Law</u> .	1152
iii) <u>Re Riverdale Hospital</u> .	1155
iv) Avenues of Redress	1160
a) <u>Cornell v. Pfizer</u> .	1160
b) The <u>Ontario Human Rights Code</u> .	1162
v) Questions	1163
b) In Canada	1164
i) <u>The Canadian Human Rights Act</u> .	1164
ii) Equal Wage Guidelines.	1165
iii) Texts of Decisions and Releases.	1166
3. <u>Analysis</u>	1178
a) Morley Gunderson, "The Male-Female Earnings Gap in Ontario."	1178
b) Armstrong and Armstrong, <u>The Double Ghetto</u> .	1183

